Welcome
Peta Wolpe, Managing Director for Sustainable Energy Africa, welcomed participants and facilitated introductions. As part of the introductions, participants were given the opportunity to share their expectations of the workshop.

Context and Purpose
Secretary of National Planning, Mr. Tshediso Matona
Mr Matona explained that the National Development Plan (NDP) was developed by the National Planning Commission, an independent advisory body appointed by the President. The NDP, a comprehensive, long-term plan that describes a shared vision for South Africa in the year 2030, includes significant input from independent experts in the various sectors. The value of independence continues in the current Commission, now in its second term, which seeks to draw on the energies and talents across society. Each participant in the room is part of this process.

The Pathway for a Just Transition project, seeking to operationalise Chapter Five of the NDP, was acknowledged as a complex process with many challenges. However, the NPC is confident that
through working inclusively with stakeholders and experts, all the important issues such as the trade-offs and compromises that are likely to be required, can be tackled. The issues being addressed in this dialogue, and others, are not just important for government, although government is the implementation agency - but are key issues that the rest of society must engage with and be aware of. Mr. Matona called for the ensuing discussions to be open and robust so that the difficult conversations can be had.

Finally, Mr. Matona recognised the hard work carried out by the Commissioners and congratulated them on their leadership and commitment during these challenging times in the country.

Commissioner Elias Masilela
Commissioner Masilela explained that an underlying principle throughout the development and implementation of the NDP is that of doing this together. Its implementation can’t be the sole responsibility of government alone. A social compact is required to inform the delivery of the Plan. If we don’t deliver on social compact, there is a high risk that the implementation of the plan will be comprised.

He highlighted the following as a key question that the National Planning Commissioners asked themselves:

“How do we go about getting to a state that brings everybody on board and how do we ensure that all South African’s have a role in the way we change to a low-carbon environment?”

The intention of the Pathway to a Just Transition project is to integrate a series of engagements with social partners to promote the support and buy-in from all South Africans as a means of responding to the above question. Commissioner Masilela maintained hope that an outcome of this dialogue series and the project as a whole will culminate in a social compact through NEDLAC thus institutionalising the outcomes.

Commissioner Masilela highlighted that whilst the time horizon of NDP was up to 2030, this process extends to 2050. He explained that the transition will be a slow and unsteady process and the achievements may only be clearly visible by this date. Therefore, milestones and targets should be set so that we know when we get there.

To assist in the process a set of critical questions were posed to the group for consideration:

1. Where are we today (country, society)?
2. What is the journey we are supposed to take as a society?
3. How do we embark on this journey?
4. When we get there, how do we know we’ve arrived?

Commissioner Masilela shared the story about how South Africa succeeded in attaining funding for Eskom to build more coal-fired power stations. At that time, the world did not want to fund more coal-based power due to the climate change. However, the government argued that without coal-power the country would shut down and this would impact on the lives of all citizens. This was the first step in changing the government’s narrative to shift from a ‘carbon transition’ to a ‘Just Transition’. This means that the transition can NOT only be about carbon but
must also include the people, the economy, and the global environment. How do we ensure that the sustainability of all these livelihoods is considered? How do we ensure we end up with a low-carbon environment that still addresses the triple challenges? How do we ensure we marry all these things?

The country has already embarked on this process, and it is hoped that by the time we get to the end state, every South African will be part of this process. The hope is that when we arrive at that shared vision we’ll have a sustainable and equitable South Africa that has addressed all the current energy, water, and land challenges that it faces. What is needed to achieve this is for every citizen to get involved in a comprehensive and deliberate manner.

**What is a Just Transition?**

The Just Transition is a framework that has been developed by the trade union movement to encompass a range of social interventions needed to secure workers' jobs and livelihoods when economies are shifting to sustainable production, including avoiding climate change and protecting biodiversity, among other challenges. It has been broadened beyond a focus on protecting the rights of the working class only but also encompasses wider society, especially the most vulnerable.

**Vision 2050: What should South Africa transition towards with a particular focus on water, land and energy?**

**Belynda Petrie, OneWorld Sustainable Investments, Peta Wolpe, Sustainable Energy Africa**

Expanding on Commissioner Masilela’s important comments about envisioning a *Pathway to a Just Transition*, the project team recognised that much has changed since the development of Chapter 5 of the NDP and new questions need to be framed whilst considering the changing and current context.

While Chapter 5 provides a framework from which the country can imagine a vision for 2030, it doesn’t provide information on how we are going to achieve this. Nor does it describe how we will know when we have arrived at our end goal. Therefore, we need to get to a point where we are more specific. Part of how the questions were designed for today’s dialogue is to bring the conversation to that level of specificity.

Using a PowerPoint presentation for illustration, Ms. Petrie highlighted elements that could inform Vision 2050: *What should South Africa transition towards with particular focus on water, land use and energy.*

Providing a snapshot of South Africa currently, she pointed out significant global gains in terms of the Sustainable Development Goals and the signing of the Paris Agreement, while at the same time pointing to the fact that South Africa is energy and mining intensive with a stagnating, highly centralised and water-scarce economy. Unemployment, poverty, and inequality remain central challenges in the country.

Gauteng province, which plays a key role as the economic and administrative capital, accounts for
36% of Gross Domestic Product (GDP) and 32% of national employment, which is highly driven by the manufacturing sector. It is highly urbanized with an unemployment rate of 28% and poverty rate at 34%. The province shows signs of growth in finance, business and government sectors. In addition, it consumes 17% of the country’s electricity. Electricity accounts for 37% of the province’s total energy demand.

It is envisaged that by 2050 South Africa’s transition to a sustainable, climate resilient, low-carbon economy and just society is well under way through urban development and compact spatial planning and environmental preservation efforts that put livelihoods at the centre. It will promote a society that is cohesive, skilled, diverse, resourceful and flexible. Coordinated planning and equitable access to secure housing, clean water, decent sanitation, affordable and safe energy could promote a South Africa all citizens work towards.

The pathway to achieve such an end state does not exclude increasing investment in low-carbon and climate-resilient infrastructure and a vibrant and engaged small and medium-sized enterprise (SME) sector facilitating climate resilient growth. In 2050 South Africa could be an integral member of global and regional renewable energy and environmental goods and services value chains. Although this requires economic changes, these are premised by significant paradigm shifts evident among all social partners, a growing public awareness of climate change and having a shared vision for the future.

Belynda Petrie presented two possible pathways for South Africa’s future: a Business As Usual (BAU) or a Sustainable and Inclusive Development Agenda (SIDA). These pathways were presented as provocations for discussion.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>THE BUSINESS AS USUAL PATHWAY</th>
<th>THE SUSTAINABLE, INCLUSIVE DEVELOPMENT AGENDA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>leads to higher inequalities, missed opportunities and increased poverty – in the name of continuing on a carbon-intensive pathway. South Africa is NOT an integral member of global and regional renewable energy and environmental goods and services value chains.</td>
<td>reflects an increasingly inclusive society, opportunities to engage alternate economic development options and the reduction of poverty over time. It also aligns South Africa with global trends and international diplomacy and policy, while reflecting reduced carbon emissions over time.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Water, Land and Agriculture

Water is an essential and public good which life depends upon. Land and water rights go hand-in-hand in South Africa, an issue that requires particular focus in the Just Transition Pathways identified. This will be central to unlocking growth in the agriculture sector, which has shown a significant decline in economic contribution in recent years, but which is expected to grow under both scenarios. Water demand is rising even though productivity has declined in the high-use agriculture sector, also signaling a requirement for focus in pathways toward a Just Transition. Importantly, a sustainable and inclusive development agenda places a greater initial demand on water but leads to higher industrialization and more efficient agriculture over time.

SA meets its global climate commitments in partnership with its cities

A study undertaken by Sustainable Energy Africa of the mitigation potential of South Africa’s 27 largest cities (including all the metros) was presented.
The energy consumption for all 27 cities shows that petrol and diesel (transport fuels) constitute almost half of all energy consumed in the cities, with electricity accounting for the bulk of the remainder. This picture is not radically different to many of the individual city profiles. When energy use is examined from a carbon emissions or climate-change perspective, the picture is somewhat different. Despite substantially higher energy use, the transport sector contributes proportionally less to carbon emissions than the built environment – the residential, commercial and industrial sectors due to the production of much higher carbon emissions per unit of energy consumed for electricity use than for liquid fuels, since electricity is largely generated from coal-fired power stations using low-grade coal.

Mapping the mitigation potential of the cities against South Africa’s peak, plateau and decline trajectory shows that it is possible to reduce their combined emissions by 38% by 2050 if energy and transport efficiency is implemented as well as cities being able to generate their own energy or buy renewable energy from IPPs. However, despite this by 2050 the curve is again increasing away from the required by science goal.

Trade-offs
Engaging in the SIDA agenda requires significant changes to the current way that South Africa operates, and will ultimately result in trade-offs. These socio-economic trade-offs need to be managed carefully. A decline in some industries, and the subsequent job losses, will need to be met with growth in new sustainable businesses and industries, requiring a forward-looking education, training, and skills sector. Costly lock-in infrastructure development that is not needed for the long-term, must, therefore, be avoided.

At the same time, there are likely to be important compromises in the Just Transition process, calling for commitment to a collective vision between the Social Partners.

In 2050 this can yield lower basic service costs, improved livelihoods for the poor and protection of the environment.
How do we get there?
Chapter 5 of the NDP proposes a multi-phased approach. While the timeframes have changed, the key phases remain relevant:

**Phase one: create the framework**
- Alignment of policies, regulations - implement institutional arrangements - develop a climate change center.

**Phase two: implementation**
- Strategies have been implemented - public investment has taken place - carbon budgets and pricing have been introduced.

**Phase three: consolidation**
- The state is well capacitated - the transition has addressed poverty and inequality, and the benefits of building resilience are evident.

**Plenary Discussion**
The following questions were raised in the Plenary following the presentations:

- Using the term “trade-offs” is problematic. We cannot make the transnational corporations happy and address climate change at the same time. There will be sacrifices and we need to call them sacrifices, or compromises. We need to not be too rosy in terms of the enormous challenges we will encounter.
- We are not fully aware of how the low-carbon pathway will affect jobs. The pathway could create more wealth but reduce employment. Furthermore, the outlook for employment as a whole seems poor as a result of Artificial Intelligence. We need to understand who we are to know where we want to go, and this has not been discussed yet.
- Better ways to measure economic growth need to be developed and adapted to South Africa because measuring Gross Domestic Product (GDP) is inadequate and does not reflect wealth distribution.
- Regarding the Vision 2050, there is no information on 1) the types of energy sources 2) the strategy required for green jobs to grow, 3) the Research and Development needed to increase efficiencies in technologies; 4) information on the localisation of technologies and their components, and 5) the mining industry.
- Some sacrifices will have to be made. The coal economy has brought economic development but it undermines the health of communities. How do we address these conflicts and challenges and have conversations that address them in real ways. We need to acknowledge that sometimes it isn’t possible to achieve a consensus.
- To envision the economy in 2050 isn’t difficult because the economic model is already moving towards renewables. However, we need to understand where we are. We are starting at the worst possible place in comparison to other countries who have been able to move to renewables. South Africa has challenges on both the supply and the demand sides and we need to start planning to develop systems and mechanisms that promote economic growth and move to a more sustainable energy model. The next 5 years is the time to find a middle ground between disruptive technology and challenges being experienced on the ground.
- There is a lack of trust in the government due to corruption. Government departments are working in silos which is undermining the collective vision for the future. Furthermore, there currently isn’t capacity or structures or political will to address these challenges.

Responses from Commissioner Tasneem Essop of the NPC
- It is clear that getting to the End State does not necessarily involve a single pathway. What we need to agree on is which pathway to choose. The NPC has not presented a vision, rather it is facilitating these discussions so that a vision can be co-created. The NPC is looking at the NDP as a guiding document, but also acknowledges that it needs to be reviewed and be based on recent information and evidence of climate change. This will also point to why we need to transition to a low-carbon economy.
- The nature of policymaking includes sacrifices, in the practical world we need to compromise to get to an agreement. There are competing interests and priorities and therefore the process will involve negotiation and compromises.
- Corporates are being confronted with very real issues on the Just Transition. There is no guidance from government, which makes the transition challenging. For business the issues are big and they are real.
- Chapter 5 does discuss winners and losers, but what it doesn’t do is identify who these winners and losers are and how this is addressed. To move forward, these conversations now need to be open and honest. As a start, these conversations must address how we transition in the next 5 years.
- The issue of distrust of government is very important, and it needs to be dealt with. The question is not who trusts whom, the question is HOW do we build trust because we need to move forward. How do we craft a government that will work for us?

Scenarios for a Just Transition towards a low carbon economy

Ms. Xolelwa Kashe-Katiya, Mapungubwe Institute for Strategic Reflection (MISTRA)

Introduction to the Research
MISTRA was invited to present on their new project which entails developing scenarios for a just transition to a low-carbon economy. The scenarios being developed by MISTRA are informed by current research and integrate innovation in methodology to allow for the strengthened understanding of perceptions and to challenge current thinking. In doing so, the initial research outlines elements that can inform how business needs to respond within Africa and globally, and more importantly, it helps us think about the skills required for the future. The Intuitive Logic Approach is being used for the research. This Approach combines creative insights with rigorous research. This has been led by researchers and was advised by a research group from Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation (DPME), Department of Environmental Affairs (DEA) and the Department of Science and Technology (DST). This approach is further strengthened by insights from experts in various fields and it promotes cross-sector engagement. Discussions framed with a long-term focus, are used to stretch the imagination beyond immediate and short-term challenges.
The key research question is “How do we build a just transition toward a socially inclusive economy by 2063?” The key anchors are 1) the transition will take place, 2) it will be just and inclusive, and 3) the end state is 2063 (aligned with African Union vision working towards 2063 horizon).

**Draft Variables**

Following the establishment of the key research questions, Draft Variables, or key issues or factors that affect a Just Transition in the South African context, were developed. While these variables have undergone a rigorous process in an effort to determine them, they remain in essence a hypothesis or intuition. They are informed by research and seek to understand trends and dynamics in various fields. This Project identified several variables, each of which was examined in further detail to understand how each share the current reality, and how they may shape the Just Transition in the future. The Draft Variables are highlighted below:

- While there are contradictions in terms of policy and implementation, limited state capacity constrains their ability to implement policy.
- The preliminary results indicate that there will be a decrease in the levels of fossil fuel employment, however, areas of manufacturing may be a promising industry.
- The spatial disparity will be improved, but rural-urban divide will remain.
- South Africa will lead innovation R&D.
- Fossil fuels will be used less for transportation- moving toward electric vehicles.
- Improved sectoral collaboration could result in meeting SDGs.
- There will be a decisive shift from centralised power plants to decentralisation of energy as well as diverse energy production.
- Higher absorption into low-carbon economy jobs and increased energy inequality and social contestation.
- Indigenous knowledge systems continue to be marginalised. Climate change will increase women’s vulnerability.
- We will create an alternative economy driven by the principles of redistribution.
- Efforts increase towards regional integration on the continent.
• Equitable lands use could promote low-carbon economy however, this will be informed by how the land use debate results, however, food security will continue to increase.
• There will be an increase in environmental awareness and South Africa will move towards carbon neutrality.
• Energy democracy will strengthen social justice, including and increase public participation. Finally, water, energy-food nexus approach will be adopted by the South African government.
• The water-energy-food nexus will be adopted

Questions and Answers

Q. Why do you see energy poverty continue, particularly with the ‘decentralising’ variable?
A. There are some contradictions in the future scenarios that the methodology results in, many of which will be investigated further in the next phases of the research.

Q. What process did you use to address the variables and ranking?
A. The process of Ranking will only begin in September. The variables have been identified through a questionnaire with various sector experts as well as interested parties through various engagement.

Q. Are you more concerned about investigating a Business As Usual pathway or is this project open to investigating dramatic changes requiring a different pathway?
A. We are not at the stage where we can determine the trajectory. We only have a mixed bag of Draft Variables. From there we will plot / map them through a democratic process which will isolate specific variables. The current Business As Usual (BAU) approach has not delivered the outcomes we choose and there has been an acknowledgement that there needs to be a shift beyond the existing way of doing business. There is still a lot of work to be done in this project, which will be presented to Project Reference Group and will evolve through further interrogation.

Q. Is the perception of continued energy poverty considering increasing Alternative Energy Sources (AES) being implemented?
A. Clearly, if we carry on with BAU we will continue with energy poverty, despite advancing technology. Unfortunately, agendas are often set elsewhere, and Africa tends to be followers. It is important to look at our context to understand how these agendas will particularly impact South Africans/Africans. So, we need to then identify which agendas we choose to participate in.

Q. When will research be published?
A. It will be submitted in October and we hope it will be published later in the year.

Developing a vision for land, water and energy: breakaway groups
Participants were allocated to three groups, all of which focused on the following questions:

1. What could a Vision 2050 be?
   a. Is the End State for 2020 in Chapter 5 of the NDP still relevant?
   b. If so, how would it lay the basis for a vision 2050?
   c. What needs to be put in place now (policy, institutional, governance, capacity, financing etc) to achieve this vision?

2. What are the primary opportunities for an inclusive, sustainable and equitable economic growth in a low-carbon, climate resilient economy?

3. How can this be undertaken in a just and sustainable manner?

4. What are the implications for land-use, water, and energy?

GROUP A
Vision 2050

- Hybrid / Carbon-neutral economy
- Inclusive society and economy
- Indicators that measure a true reflection of (inclusive) growth
- Society and economy that is transformed
- De-carbonised electricity / energy sector
- Decentralised energy system
- Sustainable development approach
- Responsive and resilient economy
- Policy harmonisation

Global Factors - Global trends can support or disable a just transition. For example, the Fourth Industrial Revolution may offer opportunities in terms of technologies, but challenges remain in terms of making that happen in the South African context. South Africa is dependent on the global community which significantly impacts the decisions that are made. If South Africa can be
Economically sustainable then we have the power to make our own decisions. South Africa can learn from China and Germany who have gone this route.

**Policy and Governance** - Policy harmonisation is required because we have different departments in conflict. If we can achieve this, we can make great strides together towards attaining the vision. We should work towards having an Energy Phakisa or CODESA. Policy uncertainty negatively impacts opportunities for investment. There is also a lack of trust between the private sector and government.

**Institutional capacity** - There are significant challenges in terms of government capacity, and efficiencies which retard implementation.

**Education and Training** - We need to link education/universities to the new and growing industries that are emerging to ensure that skills that are developed among the youth match the emerging needs of business. Innovation is required in the skills development and training in the country. We need to educate people to be entrepreneurs— to be job creators rather than job seekers. Although there has been investment in various entrepreneurship development, it hasn’t yielded the greatest success. We need to shift the education system so that school leavers are fit for the low-carbon economy and inclusive for youth. More emphasis should be put on women and how they integrate into the economy.

**Economic planning** - Indicators should be developed that measure the well-being of society and not just GDP. We need social and economic transformation together with a low-carbon economy and these need to be placed together. There are social implications for any transition, but we can manage it in a way that benefits the economy and society. There shouldn’t be an either/or- the intention is that there is a transition and at the same time you continue to work towards an inclusive society—these two are not mutually exclusive. When people look at the NDP they are looking at investment opportunities.

**Behavioural change** will need to occur to reach any vision that includes the transition to a low-carbon economy.

**More research** - We need to better understand what carbon neutral means, because that is a global issue, so we need to determine what that means for South Africa. Even if we stop all emissions now it will take 100 years or more for the globe to fully recover. Therefore, we need to be careful how we describe what that means within the national context.

**Manufacturing jobs** - New industries and products in the ‘green’ sector need to emerge to create jobs. We need to invest in building solar panels, wind farm components in this country.

**Energy** - We should “decarbonise” the energy sector”. This means looking at alternatives to coal. We know that by 2050 we will still have coal power stations; therefore, we should be more precise about what we mean about “decarbonising” the country. That can be addressed by the indicator we are targeting to reduce emissions. In the indicator, we can look at where the coal will be in 2050/2030. We know that we will be building new ones, but there are conditions with the loans to deal with the emissions. We have 3 – 5 years to retrofit existing coal plants, but this comes at a high cost. Our economy is energy constrained, therefore we need to grow energy supply. Currently, the share of coal is being reduced and replaced by renewable energy. How do we deal with stranded assets, Eskom, and the socioeconomic implications of decommissioning coal stations, the decentralisation of energy and water?
Chapter 5 Relevance – While Chapter 5 is still relevant, we are still too far behind to achieve the End State it outlines by 2030. Therefore, it is relevant but not achievable. However, ambitious targets are advisable because they can be tools one can learn from. One of the challenges is that Chapter 5 does not have targets so that we don’t have a tangible way to know if the vision has been achieved. One needs to look at developing a technical plan. A big shift is required regarding institutional arrangements, in order to implement (e.g. municipal, sectoral, provincial, departmental etc.). Planning is currently driven from a compliance approach, and it isn’t linked to the NDP and the development goals of the country. A more sustainable approach is required that links ultimate developmental objectives with activities and financial mechanisms.

Youth – there is a lack of ownership by the youth in the NDP and other policies and plans for the country. The youth are the future custodians of the country and thus realisation of the vision requires the youth be brought on board.

Land and mining - There are legacy issues with land use. There are communities that live in mining towns and isolated mining areas. How do we use that land once the mines are shut? What happens to the skills developed and the infrastructure?

The land-water nexus must be addressed as a part of the Just Transition process. South Africa is a water-scarce country. Water allocation can make any piece of land useless, so you must look at land-use and water together. The governance structures responsible for water and land, respectively, currently do not work together. These different sectors need to align their developmental goals. We need a future-plan in terms of climate change on water and agriculture and arable land etc.

What is needed to make these things happen:

- Transport emits less carbon
- Mitigate urban sprawl
- Greater cooperation between civil society and government
- Learn from lessons and adapt quickly
- New economic paradigm requires redistribution when wealth is generated.
- Vulnerable people need to be empowered and supported
- Develop policies for a circular and sharing economy to reach the vision
- Upskill and expand the education system, with a clear focus on early primary education in native languages that includes arts and crafts (to promote skills and talent in arts to promote those skills)
- Maximum wage established
- A regional biomass energy strategy to be created, that considers our water scarcity.

GROUP B
Vision 2050

- Low-carbon, neutral economy- but need to unpack neutral
• Inclusive society and economy – first and second economy and define 2nd economy
• Develop indicators, beyond GDP, that look at well-being more inclusively not just economic growth
• Decarbonisation of the energy sector as a whole
• Decentralised energy system - energy mix
• A responsive economy to technology
• Harmonised policy
• Must be a shared vision
• There must be clear indicators that match the desired vision

Energy – Displacing coal requires thought into what should replace it and how. Coal should not automatically be replaced by gas. An energy mix that responds to supply and demand needs should be developed, including a biomass strategy. In addition, a strategy should be developed that allows South Africa becoming a net exporter of energy - as well as food and waste. This will require significant restructuring of the energy sector.

Education – The education system needs a vision to ensure a relevant and skilled workforce is developed that meets the needs of new industries and emerging green economy jobs. This requires increased investment, including a focus on primary education and ensuring talented teachers. A mother-tongue policy should be developed. Furthermore, young talent should be identified and empowered early.

Private-sector and Corporate Engagement – Corporate rights should be adjusted for greater protection of access to information and decreased burden of proof. The role and responsibilities of the private sector in the implementation of the NDP, and development, should be articulated.

Policy and Governance – Integrated and cooperative government, engaging in the development of coherent policies needs to effectively facilitate the transition. A clear Climate Change Bill, digitalisation and effective urban planning policy needs to be created. Policies should include disincentive mechanisms to mitigate individual wealth enrichment. Furthermore, decentralisation is required. Finally, there should be budget allocation to implement the NDP.

Economy – A significant structural shift, which includes the restructuring of every sector, is required. New models for distribution and financing, which move away from market pricing as the dominant mode, needs to be put in place. South Africa should identify its strengths and develop an economic model that is globally integrated while benefiting South Africans. Modes of distribution should be identified and implemented. Solutions should be developed to address youth and unemployment. Solutions should include promotion of arts and culture as a part of the economy as well as different forms of jobs that create opportunities.

Society – A public consciousness about climate change needs to be developed. A devolution of power and the use of indigenous knowledge should characterise the future. Everybody should have digital access. Finally, a social compact should be developed that all South Africans share.

Transport – Business and government need to identify and fund effective solutions to the country’s transport challenges. Government must be assertive to promote investment.

Land use – Proper land use planning should be established and enforced.
GROUP C

South African context needs to be taken into consideration - Before a step can be taken forward, the inequalities of the country need to be addressed. These inequalities include access to education and decision-making. South Africa has a unique history and the solutions that worked in other countries may not be necessarily relevant and applicable here. The challenges of inequalities must be addressed alongside any activities to grow the economy.

Bottom-up approach – We need to develop solutions that put people at the center, by engaging with the public and looking at successful solutions that they have developed. We need to start taking advantage of community resilience strategies, harnessing indigenous knowledge, and looking outside the norm in conjunction with civil society and vulnerable communities. There is a perception that less fortunate people do not have solutions and are not able to adapt to changing conditions.

Education and re-skilling – the youth needs to be equipped with skills that are relevant for the future. At the moment there is a mismatch between what is being taught at school and in tertiary education facilities, and what is needed to drive an environmentally sustainable economy. Environmental, minimalistic values should be instilled in children from an early age. People also need to be empowered to make sustainable choices, and this comes with awareness-raising.

Capitalising on our resources - South Africa should look at the skills and resources that we have and are good at and focus on these rather than diluting our efforts or trying to implement measures that are neither practical nor appropriate. For example, we could lead in the hydrogen economy due to our vast Platinum resources. This should be used to define an economy / system that works for us rather than just trying to follow others. Current artisan skills should be leveraged to make efficient use of them in the low-carbon economy.

Human settlements is an important sector in this discussion. Land reform, if done correctly, can transform land use such that the land is utilised in a more sustainable way, with critical resources such as water being used in much more equitably. Population growth needs to be curtailed and migration patterns incentivised i.e. develop human settlements in a much more controlled way by incentivising or disincentivising people away from areas that will suffer in a 2°C higher world.

Value chains and maximising on benefits - The transition to a low-carbon society needs to consider the impact to value chains, instead of isolated opportunities in the decision-making process. For instance, bioenergy opportunities tackle energy, job creation, agriculture and food security, rural development and community empowerment, however, the country is focused on large-scale renewable energy projects which mainly tackle the energy sector with very little co-benefits materialised.

Private sector partnerships - Government needs to work more closely with the private sector to unlock opportunities at a faster and bigger scale.

Policy alignment - Government needs to align its policies to provide the country will clear signals. Climate change needs to be mainstreamed into all sectors, all policies, and plans. We need to be much bolder and radical actions are required if we are to meet the emissions targets as defined by science.

In summary

Peta Wolpe summarised the common themes that emerged from the group sessions as follows:
1. Education is a key recurrent theme. We need to ensure that people are prepared and engaged citizens and enable a workforce that meets the skills of a fair economy that offers opportunity for all. Furthermore, education should be viewed more broadly, encompassing not only traditional academic work but also arts and culture.

2. Low-carbon and Climate Change should be embedded in the triple challenges in the country and shouldn’t be viewed as isolated issues.

3. The voice of communities, poor, vulnerable people must be key and central to a way forward for a just transition.

Closing

Commissioner Essop

Commissioner Essop thanked the participants for their valuable inputs, some of which has been quite different to the other stakeholder dialogue workshops.

The next steps are to hold dialogue workshops in other provinces, with the project culminating in a summit in April, which will be the basis for building a social contract. Stakeholders will receive a report from this workshop including the reports from previous workshops and will be kept abreast of the progress of the project.

She indicated that the process was also open to invitations to discuss the Pathways to a Just Transition project at external constituency meetings as a means to broaden the conversation as much as possible and to have the difficult discussions regarding the hard compromises / trade-offs / negotiations that need to be had in order to move towards a social compact. It is an ongoing dialogue that will continue in the future. The organisers are open to further feedback about the process and content.
APPENDIX 1: PROJECT BACKGROUND

Pathways for a Just Transition

The National Development Plan (NDP) envisages that, by 2030, South Africa will have made headway in transitioning to a society that is just, inclusive, sustainable and resilient. Chapter Five of the NDP sets out a framework and guiding principles to ensure that by 2030 South Africa’s transition to a low-carbon, climate-resilient and sustainable economy and society will be well underway.

Transitioning to a sustainable and resilient economy and society will require systemic and structural changes that should also see the use of South Africa’s natural resources, including water and energy, resulting in appropriate economic and social development that addresses our country’s triple challenges, namely, inequality, poverty, and unemployment.

The National Planning Commission’s (NPC) work is now in its second phase, which intends to ensure the implementation of the Plan by engaging relevant stakeholders. In its plan for ensuring the implementation of Chapter 5 of the NDP, the NPC has designed a process to facilitate a series of dialogues culminating in a social compact – an agreement on what the best pathway for a Just Transition to a sustainable society would be as well as agreements on the modalities for implementation.

The dialogues include building consensus on a vision for an equitable and sustainable South Africa in 2050, as well as determining the best pathway for a just transition towards that vision. The discourse will also consider, and address current crises impacting on our ability to ensure a just transition, such as energy sector job losses and the growing water crisis, amongst others.

The vision for 2050 will be built through an iterative process of engagements and will be presented at a final national summit in April 2019.

The current political discourse frames this process and the implementation of the Plan. President Ramaphosa in the State of the Nation Address 2018 highlighted the need for South Africans to work together “by getting social partners in our country to collaborate in building a social compact on which we will create drivers of economic recovery”. He further stated that “Our country has entered a period of change. While change can produce uncertainty, even anxiety, it also offers great opportunities for renewal and revitalisation, and for progress”.

---

[Logos of the National Planning Commission and related organizations]
APPENDIX 2: KEY OUTCOMES FROM THE PROCESS TO DATE

The table below highlights the key points from each of the three breakaway groups. It is organised as either part of the vision or the pathway to achieve that vision. The different colours indicate the three different groups.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>VISION</th>
<th>PATHWAYS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Carbon neutral economy</td>
<td>• Adopt a multi-faceted approach linking social and economic development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Decarbonise electricity (implications for new coal)</td>
<td>• Monitor and understand global trends to choose when to lead and when to follow rather than just moving in ways global powers dictate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Decentralise energy sector</td>
<td>• Solutions must be person-centered, bottom-up</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Low carbon footprint</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The social and economic transformation that benefits all of society</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Energy sector growth, with energy mix increasingly renewable</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• South Africa actions / decisions internally driven and motivated, rather than taking lead from global community</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Low carbon neutral economy (unpack what neutral means)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Inclusive society and economy</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Decarbonise the energy sector</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Decentralise energy system – have an energy mix</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Policy harmonisation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Policy harmonisation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Link institutional arrangement</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Policy harmonisation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Shared vision</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Shared vision for the country and where we want to be</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Shared vision</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Enable children to express themselves - in school - in more creative ways</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Youth engages as game changes in society</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Become technology leaders</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Digital access for all</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Increase competitiveness</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Arts and culture integrated into the economy</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

General comments:
- Monitor and understand global trends to choose when to lead and when to follow rather than just moving in ways global powers dictate.
- Solutions must be person-centered, bottom-up.

General obstacles:
- Stranded assets, Eskom, socioeconomic implications of decommissioning coal stations, centralisation (energy, water & economic model/structure), lack of trust between private sector and government.

ENERGY
- Develop an energy mix that responds to supply and demand.
- SME participation in the energy sector.
- Regional biomass strategy.
- Displace coal, not with gas (no better than coal over entire supply chain).
- Achieve same fuel at the same price / alternative to fossil fuels.
- Interim measure = gas?
- Develop a strategy around net exporter (energy, food, waste).
- Restructure of the energy sector.
- Define what carbon neutral means-neutrality is a global term so we need to define within a national context.
- Define “decarbonise” in realistic terms.

EDUCATION
- The education system requires a vision for reform.
- Develop a skills economy.
- Science and technology - increase public and private sector investment.
- Focus on early and primary education.
- By 2050 we have embraced a circular economy
- A responsive economy is developed
- Accessible, affordable and clean public transport system
- Universal access to energy services (democratic)
- Universal basic income
- Social inequities addressed
- Indigenous knowledge is mainstreamed

- Ensure high quality teachers
- Mother tongue language policy
- Identify young talent early and empower that talent
- Different education system required
- Ensure education system promoting skills that match the emerging needs of business and industry
- Innovation is required in terms of skills development and training
- Entrepreneurship should be part of the education system
- Transform education starting with primary
- Equip people with meaningful skills
- Ensure teachers and curriculum are equipped to teach relevant skills
- Focus on pre-school kids
- Leverage artisan skills
- Identify what skills will be needed and how to use those skills efficiently

PRIVATE SECTOR / CORPORATE ENGAGEMENT
- Corporate rights adjusted for greater protection for access to information
- Burden of proof
- Private sector becomes involved in the NDP
- Bring in the private sector

POLICY AND GOVERNANCE
- Climate Change Bill requires clarification of objectives
- Digitalisation policy
- Policy for compact urban planning
- Disincentivise some of the mechanisms in place around individual enrichment
- Decentralisation of systems
- Coherent messaging between government departments
- Budgetary allocation provided to NDP
- Capacitate government to enable them to implement / monitor
- Promote an efficient government
- Develop tangible and measurable goals (re: Chapter 5 NDP)
- Develop a technical plan to shift what is required in terms of institutional arrangements
- Link Ch5 NDP with development agenda, move away from compliance approach
- Link institutional arrangements, budget allocation, addressing the transformation of the economic structure, policy and cooperative planning on the part of government
- Clear indicators are developed that match the desired vision
- Link NDP with current economic structure

**ECONOMY**

- Structural shift in the economy and self-sufficiency
- Develop a model of distribution of income
- Become technology leaders
- Solutions to address youth and unemployment developed
- New model for distribution / financialization in place - move away from market pricing as the dominant mode
- Different forms of jobs - not just the economy but develop enabling opportunities
- Promote arts and culture as part of the economy
- Restructuring of every sector
- Vertical processes
- Globally integrated economy (we need to be proactive rather than reactive
- Maximise work output / growth as a means of redistribution of income
- Use resources more efficiently
- Identify what we are good at as a country and follow the path from there
- Develop indicators that measure the wellbeing of society - not just GDP
- Define the second economy
- Take advantage of new industries- and the associated value changes
- First and second economies defined and acknowledged
- Develop indicators, beyond GDP, for well-being more inclusively
- Integrated planning
- Cooperative government departments and linking various systems
- Grow economy alongside decreasing inequality

**SOCIETY**
- Develop and promote a consciousness around climate change
- Ensure digital access for all
- Devolution of power
- Use indigenous knowledge
- Social compact
- From “bling” to ubuntu
- Promote positive behavioural change
- Facilitate social understanding of climate change and impacts
- Ensure all citizens, including youth, are engaged in the transformation process
- Leverage people resilience, indigenous knowledge, looking outside the norm

**HOUSING**
- Effective processes to address housing need through adaptive management
- Just governance processes all the way through

**TRANSPORT**
- Business and government fund solutions together (gov’t must be assertive)

**LAND USE**
- Proper land use planning
- Adopt a historical lens – legacy issues-to address land use

**WATER**
- Requires continual addressing to ensure it is available to all
- Pay attention to the nexus between land and water
- A plan should be developed to look at water and agriculture in view of climate change